

# Arlington Historic District Commissions

November 20, 2014  
Whittemore Robbins House

## Final & Approved Minutes

**Commissioners Present:** C. Barry, M. Bush, B. Cohen (arrived 8:49pm), C Hamilton, J. Nyberg, S. Makowka, J. Worden

**Commissioners Not Present:** D. Baldwin, J. Cummings, M. Logan, M. Penzenik

**Guests:** C. Hirani, C. Campbell, C. Therkelsen, G. Allen, R. Botterio, H. Fox, D. Fox

1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm
2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners to: Russell, Pleasant, Mt. Gilboa Commissions
3. Approval of draft minutes from October 23, 2014; pg 2, 4<sup>th</sup> paragraph remove s in simple. Moved approval by J. Worden, seconded by J. Nyberg. Unanimous approval.
4. Communications
  - a. Emails concerning work at 75 Pleasant Street (Boston Church of Christ). Neighbor from 19 Maple Street here to complain that the Maple Street side is pretty unpleasant. S. Makowka said he appreciates you coming in and there has been communication with architect detailing a number of issues with follow up coming still. The transformer was part of the approved plans. Having the transformer there has created a number of issues they are working through. The sound buffer on the roof for the back of the church is horrible according to the neighbor. The issue is that it is ugly and not taking into consideration that Maple Street property owners joined for protection of area and this project and the HDC has failed to protect in her opinion. She attended the hearings. She feels being given info at the last minute on hearings doesn't help allow ample review times. She feels we need to be looking out better for the Districts and that we failed. C. Hamilton asked why eaves look so horrible. This is an issue being addressed with contractor.
  - b. Request for COA for 187 Pleasant Street (Fox) and call from architect on window changes
  - c. CONA request for 23 Jason Street (Hammerman) re: front step changes
  - d. Commissioner interest letters from M, Audin, D. Klostermann, S. Lipp, C. Tee
  - e. M. Bush discussed meeting by HCA re: 20 Westminster Ave. that he attended as neighbor
  - f. S. Makowka received email from C. Kowalski about brick estimates on Senior Center building driveway. D. Baldwin was named Commission representative to group. (Remind S. Makowka to forward email to D. Baldwin)
  - g. M. Bush said 93 Crescent Hill replaced steps to 2<sup>nd</sup> floor deck without CONA.

## 5. New Business

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application)

8:20pm

1. **Formal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh) re: revisions on previously approved plans.** J. Nyberg recused himself as a Commissioner due to his prior relationship with applicants. Applicant wants clarification on plans and wants to continue through town permitting process. Letter was sent to them and letter was not clear requesting consideration by building department and they want to wrap this up. The Commission explained that it had approved an addition with a connecting structure with a flat roof which was deemed the most appropriate design after considering alternative designs. Our understanding is that the building inspector had a zoning issue with this design and you came back and you asked the Commission to approve a peaked roof. The Commission declined to do so but agreed to send a letter reiterating our finding that the flat roof be kept as approved. The offer to write the letter was made and the letter didn't get done until the next month so as to allow discussion of J. Worden's concerns about whether we had standing to make suggestions to the building department as to how they should interpret zoning bylaw. J. Worden summarized his understanding that the Town Zoning Bylaw requires peaked roof in this application and if you as applicant want to do otherwise, you need to pursue a variance. J. Worden said that in his opinion we should not tell building department to ignore the Town Bylaw. S. Makowka read the letter that he drafted and forwarded to Ms. Walsh, for use in her discussions with the building department, after the hearing where the content and the limits of the Commission's authority were discussed.

[Letter read into the record]. In summary, the Commission ultimately approved a design that comported most with its guidelines and was sympathetic to the original structure. As such the Commission considered a change to a peaked roof to be an undesirable change and which would be inconsistent with the charge of the Commission.

Applicant said they were unhappy with the letter and felt that there could have been a more direct letter. J. Worden said that the Commission bylaw allows it to set restrictions in addition to zoning requirements, however, in his opinion the zoning bylaw at issue was originally written the way it was to allow a double two family house on lot where the addition engaged the original building's full height and width – this zoning bylaw sets minimum standards. M. Bush said at our original review we discussed why the flat roof was better. The issue about the connector was brought up at the very first meeting and we can only view the project from our perspective and with what is under our jurisdiction. M. Bush suggested that he would be willing to join B. Cohen, S. Makowka and applicant and re-write a new letter that is more direct and to the point about the Commission's determination. S. Makowka asked for authority to rewrite letter with B. Cohen, seconded by C. Barry. Discussion. J. Worden said he does not think we should be suggesting/telling building department what they should do. S. Makowka said his motion stands, seconded by C. Barry. Motion approved 4-2, C. Barry, M. Bush, S. Makowka, B. Cohen in favor; J. Worden and C. Hamilton opposed. Letter will be sent by S. Makowka and B. Cohen

2. **Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 94 Pleasant Street (Annette Kaplan Trustee, Pleasant St Realty) re: window replacements.** J. Nyberg returned. Mr. Kaplan brought pictures of the property. He explained that his contractor ordered non-wood windows without permits, and they are all custom sized. He stated that there was a verbal discussion and approval by the building department after which they learned that they needed permission from the HDC. The existing steel casement windows

around the front and in the addition are his biggest concern. The windows ordered are classic Harvey double hung vinyl units. The pictures show the front of building windows (pg 1), and Wellington Street were all windows are visible as well as some on side.

The proposal he has come up with is to focus on cement block addition, replacing steel casement windows with Harvey double hung windows which are inset within cement block. He will cover the exposed cement blocks with a casing and sill made of wood. The casing will have band molding going all around it and then we will cover those windows with storm windows. When you cover with a storm window and when you're outside you cannot see what the window is behind. In the Applicant's perspective, the benefit is that most houses in neighborhood already have storm windows. He's trying to solve a problem for the tenants but maintain aesthetics on outside. Wood trim around windows and wooden sill to mimic a real sill.

The Commission clarified that it can't force anyone to add storm windows or prevent their removal since they are not under our jurisdiction. S. Makowka asked about the proposed treatment of the original windows, hoping that restoring those original wood windows might be a reasonable compromise. S. Makowka said he dislikes vinyl and doesn't want to set a precedent but noted that the existing non-original steel windows also detract from this property. He feels this is a workable solution from his perspective given how inappropriate existing steel windows are right now. More important is existing original fabric of house, wood windows and original part of house.

J. Worden asked about original window design and B. Cohen said they vary somewhat in the gables but front windows on 2<sup>nd</sup> floor are 1 over 1. B. Cohen said she is in support of compromise although we need to be careful how we frame it to not set a precedent for vinyl windows. This and the addition of the storms will actually help offset the impact on the district. She also feels this is a reasonable compromise and will improve the look of the property and preserve what is left of original structure especially on the upper story. J. Nyberg thanked applicant for his desire to improve building. He thinks wood windows would help building and it would make a difference having said that, the only other thing he is concerned about is down the road there is a precedent to replace with vinyl. J. Worden said if there were to be a certificate issued there should be some language addressing J. Nyberg's concern. J. Worden wants a schematic addressing which windows are what – applicant said plan to do everything down Wellington Street, turn in back, nothing on original house and only replacing metal casement windows. S. Makowka said motion could specify metal casement windows are being replaced. J. Worden asked how we address the issue of buying windows without permission.

B. Cohen moved approval of replacement of windows on the rear addition and on the filled in porch that are currently failed aluminum casement with proposed vinyl windows with storm installed on top of them and that the trim and casings be wood to match existing trim and casings on original parts of building to more nearly harmonize addition with original building and 2<sup>nd</sup> floor and bay windows visible from public right of way will not be replaced with vinyl windows. In addition, the current metal casements are to be considered the existing condition for any future proposed changes. Finally, the applicant, his contractor and the monitor shall walk through the site and review the project before any construction activity happens. Seconded by J. Nyberg. Motion failed having not received at least 4 votes in the affirmative. Commissioners – B. Cohen, S. Makowka, J. Nyberg voted in favor; M. Bush, C. Hamilton, and J. Worden opposed.

Discussion about how to how to better restrict possible precedent from these unique circumstances. C. Barry asked if building department has acknowledged their error in advising contractor to go ahead and C. Greeley and S. Makowka were told by R. Vallarelli that the discussion took place. M. Bush said he's all in favor of horse trading, but this is that without a horse. B. Cohen said she feels the horse trading is putting the wood trim on which will significantly enhance the building. Mr. Kaplan asked to continue the meeting to next month to come back with another proposal. M. Kaplan asked if any who voted against the proposal could recommend anything to help gain their approval. M. Bush suggested thinking about trim on upper story which originally was there, siding on upper story. Continuation signed.

3. **Formal Hearing re: 10 Montague Street (Silverman) for replacement of gutters – WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT**
4. **Formal Hearing re: 37 Jason Street (Lees) for kitchen renovation with exterior changes.** E. Lees presented drawings to renovate kitchen. Part 1 – want to bump out the outer wall at the rear corner. Window would go away and the door will go in its place. The corner detail will be to continue siding to match existing details. Want double door but agreed that double French door in place of proposed slider sounds good. The Commission noted the minimal visibility of this location and that double French door will meet the design guidelines. Will want to put new window in, replacing existing vinyl, to match French door. J. Nyberg moved approval of application with existing vinyl window to be replaced with new wood window, other window to be replaced with double French doors. Seconded B. Cohen. Unanimous approval. Monitor M. Bush.
5. **Informal Hearing re: 187 Pleasant Street (Fox) for window changes.** C. Marsh showed drawings. The proposed changes are minimally visible from Pleasant Street. Some vinyl windows on house but want to take out two wood replacement windows and replace with better Marvin wood windows changing the size of the opening, while still keeping locations symmetrical. Reason for this change is for interior arrangements. Windows will be 1 over 1. Siding is painted clapboard 1<sup>st</sup> floor and shingles on 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Head of windows will align. Window on back will be taken out to allow bathtub to be installed and then put back in place. S. Makowka proposed this to be so insubstantial to be eligible for a 10 day certificate. Seconded by M. Bush. Unanimous approval that this is so insubstantial as to qualify for a certificate pending notification and a 10 day response period. S. Makowka proposed motion to approve removal and replacement of two smaller window on driveway side at 187 Pleasant Street, specified that new windows to match specification in design guidelines (including all wood, no trim, all finish trim to match existing conditions on house). We acknowledge removal of rear window for construction purposes provided that it will be reinstalled per original conditions. Seconded by B. Cohen. Unanimous approval. Monitor J. Nyberg.

## 6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtor
- c. Discussion re: AHDC District Maps – M. Bush will work on consolidating comments
- d. At-Large Commissioner Vacancies – C Greeley to send email telling them we will discuss
- e. Discussion re: Town Procedures for Significant Properties List

- f. Discussion re: Academy Street Paving Options with Neighbors – Coming in December
- g. J. Worden has info on Master Plan and his caution is that although the Citizens Committee raised a bunch of issues, he feels that the consultants ignored that and wrote up their own ideas of recommendations. It is online and he suggests people look at it and give feedback. Hearing input supposed to be delivered by 12/1 and formal hearing is January 12, 2015.

## **7. OPEN FORUM**

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

## **8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)**

### **Project List:**

1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
11. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
12. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
13. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
14. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
15. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
16. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 12-14P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
17. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) Penzenik - COA (House Redesign)
18. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
19. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
20. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
21. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
22. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) Cohen – COA (House Addition)
23. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
24. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
25. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
26. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)
27. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
28. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
29. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
30. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
31. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
32. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
33. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)

34. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
35. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
36. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
37. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka –COA (solar panels)
38. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)
39. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
40. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
41. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
42. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
43. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
44. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
45. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
46. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
47. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
48. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
49. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
50. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
51. 24 Central Street (Donnelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
52. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
53. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
54. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
55. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
56. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
57. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)
58. 135 Pleasant St. Unit 9&10 (Atkinson-Bing – 13-73P) – Makowka – COA (a/c condenser and rear porch door)
59. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)
60. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-77P) – Barry – COA (skylight)
61. 11 Russell Terrace (Boroway – 14-01R) – Makowka – CONA (basement windows/siding)
62. Lot 47 (aka 247) Pleasant Street (Alouette Rlty/Noonan – 14-02P) – COA (New Building)
63. 111 Pleasant St. (Fredieu – 14-03P) – COA (Awnings)
64. 40 Westmoreland Ave. (Radoslovich – 14-04M) – CONA (Rear & deck sliders)
65. 17 Russell St. (Makowka –14-05R) – 10 Day COA (roof & gutters)
66. 21 Oak Knoll (Donal – 14-06P) – CONA (side door)
67. 59 Jason Street(Bouvier – 14-07J) – CONA (fence)
68. 187 Lowell Street (Grinnell – 14-08M) – CONA (Gutters, chimney, roof)
69. 195 Pleasant Street (Hamel – 14-09P) – CONA (Gutters, Window sill)
70. 39 Russell Street (Walsh – 14-11R) - COA (Addition new wing, repairs existing house)
71. 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa – 14-12M) – COA (Solar Panels)
72. 27 Jason Street (Worden – 14-13J) – CONA (Rear roof)
73. 105 Pleasant Street (Erulkar – 14-14P) – 10 Day COA (Gutters)
74. 105 Pleasant Street (Erulkar – 14-15P) – CONA (Wood trims)
75. 20 Westmoreland Ave. (Housing Corp Arl – 14-16M) – CONA (Roof)
76. 742 Mass. Ave.(Davidson – 14-17J) - CONA
77. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 14-18P) – CONA (Windows)
78. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 14-19P) – CONA (Garage)
79. 81 Westminster (Lemire – 14-21M) – CONA (Roof)
80. 17 Jason Street (Harrington – 14-22J) – CONA (Roof)
81. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 14-23P) – CONA (Front Porch Steps, Landing, Rear Windows)
82. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 14-24P) – 10 Day COA (Gutters)
83. 54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 14-25M) – COA (Addition)
84. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 14-26P) – COA (Siding)
85. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 14-27P) – COA (Front Steps, Garage Renovations)

- 86.** 268 Broadway (Carlton-Gyson – 14-28B) – COA (Fence)
- 87.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-29P) – CONA (Front Porch Steps, Fascia, Soffits)
- 88.** 151 Lowell Street (Wyman – 14-30M) – CONA (Wood Trim)
- 89.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-31P) – 10 Day COA (Fiberglass Gutters)
- 90.** 99 Westminster Ave. (Doctrow – 14-32M) – 10 Day COA (Heat Pump)
- 91.** 742 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 14-33J) – CONA (Siding, Corner Boards)
- 92.** 105 Pleasant Street (Malcomson – 14-34P) – CONA (Rear Storm Door)
- 93.** 20 Maple Street (Kapinos – 14-35P) – CONA (Shingles, Rakes)
- 94.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 14-36P) – CONA (Roof Shingles)

Meeting Adjourned 11:00pm